Journal of Global Social Sciences **March 2023, Volume 4, Number 13, 77-101**
ISSN: Print 2735-9328, Online 2735-9336

DYNAMIC RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN CORPORATE GOVERNANCE PRACTICES AND MANAGERIAL EFFICIENCY: SPECIAL REFERENCE TO NIGERIA PORT AUTHORITY

O.S. BAMISAYE, (CA)

Business Administration , Azteca University, Mexico

samuel_bamisaye@yahoo.com

&

A.N. NKITMA,

Business Administration*, Azteca University, Mexico*

Abstract

There are continuous growing in the awareness and interest of the corporate governance practices in modern-day corporations in which most of this public corporation because of the unexpected liquidations of the corporation's examples like the Enron Corporation, WorldCom, Parmalat, Barings Bank and other global brands. The fall of all these corporations among others in the world has been cause by an unethical business conduct; accounting fraud, poor corporate governance practices and managerial inefficiencies these became lesson points for corporate organisations the world over, including Nigeria. The challenges facing the cooperate governance has become a serious and devastated problem for the Nigerian firms which leads to a reduction rate in the contributing to the gross domestic product which in turn decrease the rate of unemployment. The importance of corporate governance is to ensure compliance with all the processes, rules and regulations for well-organized delivery of managerial efficiencies in the development of a nation. This also has become an important argument among the scholars, reasons because of the failure of government, which is sponsored by the previous large state corporations across the globe. This study, therefore, study the dynamic relationship between Corporate Governance Practices and managerial efficiency: special reference to Nigeria port authority, the study adopted a cross-sectional descriptive research approach using quantitative research method, in which a self-administered questionnaire in the gathering of data, the regression model, ANOVA results and Duncan's post hoc tests are the statistically technique which was used for the data analysis. In which six (6) of the questionnaires retrieved were found to be improperly filled -that is, which means that there are incomplete data which was not included in the analysis. The study concludes that the study reflects the results shows that there is a high level of corporations in the measures of the extent of compliance with corporate governance practices, also returning equally high percentages in the measures of level of perceived managerial efficiency recorded in them. The results later show that the public corporations falls into same group level of compliance of the practices corporate governance practices as in level of managerial efficiency.

Keywords: *Managerial Efficiency, Public Corporation, Corporate Governance***.**

DOI: 10.58934/jgss.v4i13.136

1. Introduction

Corporate governance seems to be a body of rules that governing companies in terms of management and supervision by the board of directors, it is perhaps a mechanism designed to ensure stability of the economy and successful achievement of corporate goals. A major aspect of corporate governance relates to the nature and extent of accountability of a class of individuals in the organisation and the mechanisms put in place to reduce or eliminate the principal-agent problem, identified as a conflict of interests (Rwegasira, 2000). In Nigeria, the mechanism of corporate governance as stipulated in the Companies and Allied Matters Act (1990) and guidelines as enshrined in the Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria. Corporate governance, essentially focuses on the structures within which a corporate organisation or enterprise (be it public or private) receives its basic orientation and direction towards the management and running of a corporate entity (Rwegasrra, 2000).

Essentially, corporate governance can be conceptualised from two perspectives - narrow and broad. The narrow perspective merely focuses on the structures within which a corporate entity enterprise receives its basic orientation and direction (Rwegasira, 2000). Under the broad perspective, it is considered as being the heart of both a market economy and a democratic nature of modern society (Sullivan, 2000). Osaze (2007) states that the entire function of corporate governance is to guarantee transparency, safeguard investors interests, ensure full disclosure of executive actions and corporate activities to stakeholders. Corporate governance function also includes assessment of environmental impact of corporate activities, assurance of performance related to executive compensation and full disclosure of executive Compensation.

Generally, these bodies are set up by law to fulfill the needs and aspirations of the public and some are statutorily authorised to collect revenue and harness resources for the benefit of the generality of the citizens. Though corporate governance in Nigeria and many African countries are still at an infancy stage as adopted by Wilson (2006)_ a review of extant studies in this area reveals that, a lot of researchers have focused attention on corporate governance in banks and other financial institutions, despite the potentials of research undertaking in the public sector

There is growing awareness and interest in corporate governance practices in contemporary corporations especially public corporations due to the surprising collapses of a number of corporations like Enron Corporation, WorldCom, Parmalat, Barings Bank and other global brands. The failures of these corporations among all others in developed and developing countries have been attributed to unethical business conduct; accounting fraud, poor corporate governance practices and managerial inefficiencies these became lesson points for corporate organisations the world over, including Nigeria. In Nigeria, the need for corporate governance came to the fore as a result of the systemic threat posed to the financial sector due to the operational malfunctioning of many banks in the 1990s.

These identified issues in corporate governance practices have reverberated in other sectors, particularly the public sector in Nigeria. A review of extant literature reveals a perception that Nigerian public corporations suffer from agency problems reflected in the way public servants seek to satisfy their personal interests at the expense of the government and other stakeholders. Existing literature reviewed also show that many studies have been carried out on corporate governance practices and corporate performance, showing use of chief executive officer tenure, board size, board composition, return on equity, assets size as measures or determinants of managerial efficiency; but very few studies give attention to the individual abilities and competence of the manager as measures of managerial efficiency. Coupled with what has been earlier stated, the causes of the perceived managerial inefficiencies in Nigerian public corporations and the challenges the manager may be experiencing in the efficient discharge of his duties and obligations are unsettled issues requiring research attention.

This research is motivated by the need to examine how an enabling environment can be created for the manager to acquire and put to use the needed skills for the practice of sound corporate governance. In addition, it investigates how corporate governance practices influence managerial efficiency in Nigeria Port Authority. The aim of this study is to examine the dynamic relationship between corporate governance practices and managerial efficiency of Nigeria Port Authority. Specific objectives of the study is to investigate the dynamic relationship between effective corporate governance practices and managerial efficiency in Nigeria Port Authority and the question of what is the dynamic relationship between corporate governance practices and managerial efficiency in Nigeria Port Authority? While null hypothesis; there is no relationship between corporate governance practices and managerial efficiency in Nigeria was tested.

The motivation for this study stems out of the perceived decadence in the public sector and the concern for the devastating effects of poor adherence to corporate governance practices arising from management inefficiencies, on national growth and development in Nigeria. This study is designed to explore and consider to a reasonable extent factors relating to corporate governance that affect managerial efficiency in Nigerian Port Authority; especially due to the fact that few studies have been carried out on dynamic relationship between corporate governance practices and managerial efficiency. Hence, the study will fill the gap in current literature.

2. Literature Rereview

A review of extant literature reveals corporate governance is an imprecise concept which has been conceptualised in so many ways by different scholars and practitioners. Thus, "Corporate Governance" has been recognised to mean diverse things to different people. According to Oyedijo and Soyibo (2001) corporate governance is viewed from at least two viewpoints. There is the narrow perspective which is apprehensive about the arrangements within a corporate entity and its intricate orientation and direction and is considered as being the heart of both a market economy and a democratic society. The narrow view observes corporate governance in relation to issues about shareholder protection management control and the widespread principal-agency problems (Olayiwola, 2010).

Transparency and probity offer the framework for formulation and implementation of policies and programmes and emphasise the guidelines for economical and efficient management of resources to ensure effective performance of corporate organisations. According to Oshionebo (2004, transparency relates to process of governance and demands that the fiscal and monetary operations of government be well planned, accomplished and reported to the Nigerian public with absolute honesty. Foscher (1999) interprets the significance of transparency as, providing feedback for informed debate on public issues and policies, which results in better programmes and management of the nation's resources.

3. Methodology

This study adopts the cross-sectional descriptive research approach using quantitative research method. This research approach involves describing a problem, context or an in-depth situation that warrants research attention. Generally, descriptive type questions are more structured, and reliant on prior ideas and methods (Cooper & Schindler. 2011). It provides an accurate description or picture of a particular Situation or phenomenon at one point in time. This approach does not try to establish cause and affect relationships (as in longitudinal studies), instead it attempts to identity variables that exist in a given situation. The study area of this research is Lagos State, Nigeria, situated in the South-Western part of Nigeria. Lagos state is one of the largest cities in Nigeria with a high rate of growth, having an urban status since 1917 (Mabogunje, 1968: Adelakun. 2009). It is also, Nigeria's corporate, commercial and industrial nerve centre (Oteri & Ayeni, 2016: Babalola, 2016), with all the establishments that form the fulcrum of this study having not only their presence here in Lagos state but carrying out a lot of their organisational activities here also.

The target population of this study comprises all the employees belonging to the management cadre (made up of top. middle and lower level management) of the Nigeria Port Authority in the public sector in Nigeria. Sampling is a procedure for the selection of a unit or a subset from a larger group or population for the purpose of making predictions or statistical inferences to a larger population (Wrenn, Stevens & Loudon. 2002). Data collected for this study was through the use of self-administered questionnaire. According to Hair, Bush and Ortinau (2003), the sources of data used in a given study depend on two factors: whether the data already exists, and the purposes for which the data will be collected and to be used. The primary data used in this study were gathered through the use of self-administered questionnaire with some of the questions adapted and modified from previous studies, this is the most commonly used research instrument in survey research. The secondary data are second hand data or information which has been previously collected or used by someone else for the purpose from previous researches (Lancaster, 2005), the secondary sources comprised of archival publications, review of previous published studies: journals, general reports on the sectors under study, conference proceedings, newspapers, and dissertations/theses relevant to the present study.

Limitations of the Study

Despite careful planning and designs, every research undertaking is confronted with certain circumstances which are outside the control of the researcher which may serve as limitations to the research work. These limitations determine to an extent the degree to which the findings an conclusions of the research undertaking can be drawn or generalised (Marilyn and Jim, 2013)

The limitations of this study are briefly discussed in the following lines:

First the researchers experienced difficulty gaining access into some of the public establishments used for this study in spite of the letter of introduction from the department.

Another difficult was in getting some members of staff to assist in coordinating the monitoring of filling in and retrieving the research instrument. In these same establishments, some of the employees were reluctant to accept and respond to the questionnaire. Some of the reasons given were that they were too busy and had limited time to respond to the questionnaire with the result that fewer questionnaire than expected or earlier planned were distributed in such establishment. An example of such is the Central Bank of Nigeria, accounting for the low number of respondents from this government establishment. It took repeated visits by the researcher to this establishment and a staff contact within the establishment to obtain the number of responses utilised for this study.

This study was carried out in the Lagos offices of the six public corporations used for this study. Despite the fact that the headquarters of majority of these government establishments are based in Abuja, it was gathered that most of their operations or business activities take place in these Lagos Offices as Lagos remains the commercial nerve centre of Nigeria. The managers in the offices of these selected public corporations located in other parts of the nation were not covered in this study. It is possible that their level of compliance to corporate governance practices and level of managerial efficiency differ from the results obtained from the study of the managers in the Lagos offices as their operating spheres are different. The effects this may have on the study findings, has been brought to the barest minimum by the study being undertaken in Lagos where a large portion of the operational activities of these public corporations take place.

Another limitation this study experienced is the fact that few studies have been carried out on this topic corporate governance and managerial efficiency in Nigeria especially, using the measures of managerial efficiency used in this study. As a result, obtaining adequate literature for this study was difficult. The researcher had to review a lot of literature from various sources on related or similar topics carried out within and outside Nigeria and carry out adjustments to make them relevant to this study. This was a major limitation to this study.

Obtaining some information needed to enrich the findings and conclusions from this study were practically impossible. Specifically, despite several attempts through repeated visits, phone calls, oral interviews and extensive search on the internet, in journals, annual reports of selected establishments and other literature, it was practically impossible to get the exact number of managers (in the range used for this study) in majority of these establishments. Also, the comprehensive salary structure in actual scales, figures and printable official format, as is present in the Federal Civil Service were not available. The best that the researcher could obtain were the different nomenclature for the salary structures of the various public corporations and few scattered and sketchy references to salaries for some positions. The researcher had to resort to using figures and their equivalents on the available Federal Civil Service Salary Structure to obtain responses on monthly salaries from the respondents.

4. Data Presentation and Analysis

Data screening, Editing and Presentation

The questionnaires retrieved from the field were edited to make sure that only those properly completed were used for data analysis. Those that were improperly filled or having unsatisfactory responses were discarded. Questionnaire having unreadable, multiple, missing or vague responses, fall into this category. In carrying out the exercise sub-titled above, six (6) of the questionnaires retrieved were found to be improperly filled -that is, they had incomplete data and were therefore not included in the analysis

Analysis of Questionnaire Distribution and Response Rate

Socio-Demographic Characteristics of Respondents

Table 4.1 Socio - Demographic data of the respondents

Variables	Response Label - Frequency		Percentage
Gender			
	Male	69	75.0
	Female	23	25.0
	TOTAL	**92**	**100**
Age			
	30 - 39 years	51	55.4
	40 - 49 years	15	16.3
	50 – 59 years	23	25.0
	above 60 years	03	03.3
	TOTAL	**92**	**100**
Marital Status			
	Single	29	31.5
	Married	63	68.5
	TOTAL	**92**	**100**
Educational Qualification			
	HND/B.Sc/B.Ed	72	78.3
	M.Sc./MBA	20	21.7
	TOTAL	**92**	**100**
Management Cadre			
	Top Level Management Salary Grade Level 13 – 17 or its equivalent	03	3.3

Middle Level Management (Salary Grade Levels 10 to 12 or their equivalents)	26	28.3
Lower Level Management (Salary Grade Levels 08 to 09 or their equivalents)	63	68.5
TOTAL	**92**	**100**

Source: Field Survey, 2022

An analysis of the results in Table 4.1 shows there were more males respondents 69 (75.0%) than females 23 (25.0)%. This implies that there are more males in the management cadre in Nigerian Port Authority than females. For ages of respondents, 51 (55.4%) are within the ages 30 - 39, 16.3% within 40 to 49 years, 25.0% of respondents are within age 50 – 59 while 3,o% are above 60years. This shows that a large percentage of the respondents are matured enough to understand the questions and are as well energetic, thus increasing the reliability of the answers. Also, majority of them are within the age ranges of 30 to 39years. This could be explained by the fact that these ranges fall within the considered productive years of an employee. 68.5% of the respondents are married, 31.5% are single. This reflects that most of the staff in the management cadre in public corporations (especially Nigeria Port Authority) in Nigeria are married (68.5%) as against only 31.5% in other marital categories.

In terms of level of education, table 4.1 shows that 72 (78.3%) of the respondents possess either Higher National Diploma, or Bachelor degree, 20 (21.7%) are holders of the masters' degree (M.Sc/MBA). This implies that majority of the staff in various managerial cadres in public corporations in Nigeria are academically qualified represented by 100% (the total number of managerial staff from B.Sc/B.Ed/HND to Master levels).

As regards the management cadre, a large number of the respondents (63) representing 68.5% belonged to lower level management (equivalent of levels 08 to 09), followed by 26 (28.3%) in middle level management cadre (equivalent of grade levels 10 to 12) and the least was 3 (3.3%) in top management position (equivalent of grade levels 13 to 17). This is understandable, there are usually fewer people at the top management positions due to the years of experience on the job, educational and professional qualifications required in occupying such positions. The responses analysed in Table 4.1 regarding the study population in respect of the socio-demographic variables examined, establishes diversity across respondents. This validates the fact that the data gathered is balanced and suitable for the purpose of this study as all cadres of management are represented.

Results related to Research Question

1.	Pre-defined (structured) appointment processes exist for the appointment of management board members	0 (0)	67 (72.8)	3 (3.2)	0 (0)	22 (23.9)	92 (100)
2.	The current mix of skills/experience on the Board of Directors serves the organisation's interest.	23 (25.0)	18 (19.6)	26 (28.3)	25 (27.2)	0 (0)	92 (100)
3.	There are clearly defined rules that ensure explicit separation of duties and responsibilities between the offices of the chairman Chief Executive Officer	15 (16.3)	29 (31.5)	0 (0)	26 (28.3)	22 (23.9)	92 (100)
4.	There are external experts with adequate training and experience on the Board of Directors/Advisory Board and Steering Committee	15 (16.3)	29 (31.5)	26 (28.3)	22 (23.9)	0 (0)	92 (100)
5.	The Board is composed of an adequate number of people to monitor and review the implementation of the strategy and all items in sufficient depth.	0 (0)	67 (72.8)	3 (3.3)	22 (23.9)	0 (0)	92 (100)
6	Proactive structures and arrangements are in. place to promote the independence of the Board from unnecessary interference.	18 (19.6)	49 (53.3)	3 (3.3)	0 (0)	0 (0)	92 (100)
7	Government control/interference weakens the independence of Board.	0 (0)	51 (55.4)	41 (44.6)	0 (0)	0 (0)	92 (100)
8	The Board has developed a policy framework that is central to the way it is directed to prevent third influence	15 (16.3)	51 (55.4)	0 (0)	26 (28.3)	0 (0)	92 (100)
9	All the sub-committees formed have a clear set of objectives that are independent of each other for efficient functioning.	15 (16.3)	77 (83.7)	0 (0)	0 (0)	0 (0)	92 (100)
10	The organisation maintains a separate head for all its sub-committees that report to the main Board management for deliberation and approval.	45 (48.9)	47 (51.1)	0 (0)	0 (0)	0 (0)	92 (100)
11.	This organization delivers high quality service to customer	26 (28.3)	63 (68.5)	3 (3.3)	0 (0)	0 (0)	92 (100)
12.	This organization has succeeded in building strong relationship with customers	25 (27.2)	67 (72.8)	0 (0)	0 (0)	0 (0)	92 (100)
13.	This organization has developed strong adaptability to environmental challenges	15 (16.3)	51 (55.4)	0 (0)	26 (28.3)	0 (0)	92 (100)
14.	The number of customer complaints within the last period has decreased significantly	0 (0)	48 (52.2)	15 (16.3)	29 (31.5)	0 (00	92 (100)
15.	In this organization productivity per employee is well above the industry average	0 (0)	89 (96.7)	3 (3.3)	0 (00	0 (0)	92 (100)

16	There are structures in place to prevent conflicts between the interests of the directors and management on the one side, and those of shareholders and other stakeholders on the other.	22 (23.9)	67 (72.8)	3 (3.3)	0 (0)	0 (0)	92 (100)
17	In this organisation, the flow of information (both vertical and horizontal) is very smooth.	38 (41.3)	51 (55.4)	3 (3.3)	0 (0)	0 (0)	92 (100)
18	In this organisation, there is a high degree of internal cohesion among employees.	23 (25.0)	51 (55.4)	3 (3.3)	15 (16.3)	0 (0)	92 (100)
19	This organisation has formal mechanisms and systems that ensure transfer and assimilation of best practices across its various functional units.	23 (25.0)	69 (75.0)	0 (0)	0 (0)	0 (0)	92 (100)
20	This organisation conducts internal reviews and analysis of policies, and procedures to sustain improvement propositions of employees	45 (48.9)	44 (47.8)	3 (3.3)	0 (0)	0 (0)	92 (100)

Source: Field Survey, 2022

5. Summary of Findings

This part presents a summary of the major findings of this research work. It also provides a formal conclusion of the findings on the study of the topic Corporate Governance and Managerial Efficiency in Selected departments of Nigeria Port Authority in Nigeria. It covers the following issues: Implications (theoretical and managerial), recommendations to governments, organisations, regulatory bodies and managers, the main contributions of the study to the frontier of knowledge, suggestions for further studies and the limitations of the study.

The results of the research findings on the objectives and hypotheses of this study set out to achieve are summarised here.

In ascertaining whether public corporations in Nigeria comply with codes of corporate governance, evidence from the study from the results in' Tables show that they all do. This is reflected in the aggregate mean results of each of the corporations on the level of compliance being above the average mean of 4 (4.19 -5.58) on a 7-point Likert scale with an aggregate mean of 4.6, aggregate standard deviation of less than 1 (0.84) and percentage compliance all above the benchmark of 54.17% (59.9%-80%). The regression model, ANOVA results and Duncan's post hoc tests reflect a statistically significant difference between group means and how the companies can be divided into groups. The ranking perceived by of compliance the respondents on the aggregate are in this order - Audit committee and reporting takes the lead, followed by due process in appointment and composition of board members, Board adherence to internal rules of procedure, Transparency and disclosure, compliance with ethical standards, proper management of related risks, board independence, proper handling of ethical issues, freedom from political influence or control and monitoring and evaluation. The results of this statistical analysis run contrary to hypothesis one.

The focus of hypothesis two was to determine if there was a relationship between corporate governance and managerial efficiency in Nigerian public corporations. The multiple regression result as shown in Table 4.15 establishes that there exists a statistically significant positive relationship at 5% level of significance between corporate governance and managerial efficiency with an R-Squared value of 64.4% and F-value of 77.394. This implies that corporate governance is a predictor of managerial efficiency. As a result, hypothesis two is not supported.

The empirical findings from the regression analysis and ANOVA results in Table 4.17 regarding hypothesis four, establish that ethical issues in corporate governance affect managerial efficiency in public corporations. With R-squared value of 36.7% and F-33109 at 5% level of significance, it can be concluded that there exists a positive and statistically significant relationship between ethical issues and managerial efficiency in Nigerian public corporations.

It is pertinent to note that this study provides empirical evidence that public corporations fall into exactly the same groupings in level of compliance with corporate governance practices as in level of managerial efficiency. The Duncan's Post hoc Tests for corporations based on corporate governance practices (Table 4.10) and managerial efficiency (Table 4.20) reveal this relationship clearly. In ranking and groupings, the level of adherence to corporate governance practices reflects directly in the same way and significantly on the level of managerial efficiency.

Conclusion

This research work was carried out to investigate the relationship between corporate governance and managerial efficiency in public corporations in Nigeria. The findings from this study have led to the conclusions reported below.

1. The study concludes that strict compliance with existing code of corporate governance is an important factor in ensuring managerial efficiency in public corporations. This is revealed in the findings of this study as reflected in the results of the Duncan's post hoc tests. The results show corporations with high percentages in the measures of the extent of compliance with

corporate governance practices, also returning equally high percentages in the measures of level of perceived managerial efficiency recorded in them. The results further show the public corporations falling into exactly the same groupings level of compliance with corporate governance practices as in level of managerial efficiency, The rank order analyses also reveal this relationship clearly.

2. There exists a statistically significant positive relationship between corporate governance and managerial efficiency is one of the conclusions drawn from the results of this study. This is implied in the result showing that as predictor of managerial efficiency, 64.4% of variation in the response variable (managerial efficiency) is accounted for by variations in corporate governance. The ANOVA results with the high F-value (77.934) at 5% level of significance also support this assertion. In conclusion, corporate governance predicts managerial efficiency.

3. The results of the analysis carried out on the reliability of the survey instrument used in this study found that there was a high level of internal consistency by the overall values obtained. Regarding the main independent variable, corporate governance, the overall reliability value was considered satisfactory at 0.848. All the individual measures (board appointments and composition, board independence, rules, ethical compliance, audit committee and reporting, transparency and disclosure, related risk attributes including the additional three independent variables postulated in this study -political influence, ethical issues and monitoring and evaluation) also returned satisfactory alpha values ranging from 0.604 to 0.979. The data gathered and the research findings presented an accurate picture of the reality of how the corporations studied stand, in relation to the extent of corporate governance practices in each, proving the validity of the research instrument.

This implies that the instrument used actually measured the concept in question.

4. This research work also concludes that majority of public corporations in Nigeria comply with codes of corporate governance though with varying degrees of compliance ranging between 59.9%-80%. All the selected public corporations used in this study returned with mean values above the average (4) and percentage values above the benchman percentage (57.14%). The ranking of compliance as perceived by the respondents on the aggregate are in this order - Audit committee and reporting, board appointment and composition, rules, transparency and disclosure, ethical compliance, related risk attributes, board independence, ethical issues, political influence and monitoring and evaluation

5. In addition, the study concludes that outside of already existing or known corporate governance practices (audit committee and reporting board appointment and composition, rules, transparency and disclosure, ethical compliance, related risk attributes, board independence) other independent variables exist which impact on managerial efficiency in public corporations. The findings of this study lead to the conclusion that political influence, ethical issues, monitoring and evaluation also influence the managerial efficiency in public corporations in Nigeria.

6. In conclusion, there is evidence of managerial efficiency in majority of public corporations in Nigeria. The results of this study show respondents in agreement that five out of the six selected public are managerially efficient in varying proportions with percentage ratings between 52% and 76%. Public corporations in Nigeria by inference therefore can be reported to be managerially efficient.

Theoretical and Managerial implications of the study

There are significant theoretical and managerial implications from the findings of the study for governments, organisations and regulatory bodies responsible for each of the sectors in the public service.

Theoretical Implications

This study established the relationship between the study variables corporate governance and managerial efficiency. In establishing the nature of relationship between each of the elements of the independent variable (corporate governance) and the dependent variable (managerial efficiency), the parties affected by the activities of public corporations (stakeholders in general) will be able to understand and determine where adjustments are needed to obtain an optimal mix of the different elements of corporate governance to attain managerial efficiency

Furthermore, the results of this study increases the support for the incorporation of the additional independent variables introduced into the elements of measure of corporate governance. This is imperative as the results of the multiple regression analyses carried out on them reveal, they impact on managerial efficiency as well and could be responsible for the inability of the other earlier existing measures to attain the maximum possible level of managerial efficiency in public corporations. In essence by implication, adequate attention should be given to the effects of ethical issues, monitoring and evaluation and political influence on corporate governance practices in public corporations.

This study provides a modified framework for fully understanding the relationship between corporate governance and managerial efficiency, by broadening the scope of measures of each, incorporating important influencing factors which before now had been disregarded or ignored. For the independent variable (corporate governance) three of such were postulated and for the dependent variable (managerial efficiency) four efficiency indicators (criteria) for assessing each manager is introduced/provided for this study and would be highly useful for a better understanding and assessment of these variables in future by governments, regulators, managers, general public and finally the academia in future studies on these variables,

Managerial Implications

Findings of this study revealed the need for concerted efforts to improve on corporate governance systems in the Nigerian public sector. The starting point is to engage in a thorough examination of the corporate governance framework with the goal of modifying its constituent elements in a way that will accommodate the context and peculiarity of public sector structure and mode of operations.

In addition, efforts should be made to encourage all the stakeholders to buy into or get involved in corporate governance issues. The intention is to get all the stakeholder to work towards the effective implementation of corporate governance code and practice. More importantly, monitoring and evaluation or compliance divisions should be constituted in all government establishments to ensure full compliance to corporate governance practices and code.

Recommendations to Governments

Based on the findings of this study, the following recommendations are suggested so that corporate governance practices in public corporations can be improved upon and the efficiency of managers enhanced for better satisfaction of the various stakeholders.

1. An obvious point deduced from the results of this study is that public corporations in Nigeria generally do not adhere strictly or completely to the practice of corporate governance as expected as none of them though self-assessed, recorded up to 100%compliance rating. This directly impacts on the level of managerial efficiency in

these public corporations and may be responsible for the negative perception of the public about them. It behoves the management teams of public corporations therefore, lo strive for better and stricter level of compliance with laid down standards of corporate governance. This is because maximum compliance with these standards will ensure higher efficiency levels of managers in these public corporations and by inference, better satisfaction of stakeholder expectations.

2. The various regulatory bodies or agencies responsible for each of the sectors in the public service should pay more attention to the activities of managers in public corporations under them. These regulators should ensure through monitoring and evaluation that public corporations adhere strictly to corporate governance standards; with units within each sector to monitor and evaluate the level of adherence to corporate governance standards by public corporations as stipulated within the sector. This can be done through intentional regular impromptu visits to these corporations by the various regulatory agencies. Such surprise visits will encourage deliberate attempts at compliance by the management teams of the public corporations which will in turn enhance managerial efficiency and by extension, satisfaction of stakeholder expectations
3. The findings of this study have shown that the level of compliance to codes of corporate governance vary from corporation to corporation. The differences could be attributable to the effectiveness of the different regulatory bodies in charge of the public corporations. It could also be attributable to the ineptitude, incompetence or negligence of the managers in charge of these corporations. To achieve higher and better levels of compliance therefore, it is recommended that each of the regulatory agencies wake up to their assigned regulatory responsibilities as laid down by acts establishing them. These agencies in turn should put stiff penalties in place to sanction corporations who fall below expected adherence standards to enhance compliance.
4. The information gathered from responses to questions on the effects of political influence on managerial efficiency in public corporations show that there is a positive and statistically significant relationship between the two variables. This means that if the political influence is negative and not in consonance with the statutory standards governing sound corporate governance practices in public corporations, managerial efficiency is affected adversely and vice-versa. There are indications of political interference and party patronage by the government in power in the appointments of board members, employees as well as managers in the public corporations selected for

this study among other influences which may be considered negative, though it varied from corporation to corporation. It is therefore recommended that the level of political interference/party patronage by the government in power in public corporations should be minimal, with appointments following due processes and managers given a free hand in making decisions concerning the corporations under their control.

5. The parties affected by the activities of public corporations go beyond just the government. In view of the fact that other stakeholders which include suppliers, other financial investors in some cases, employees, managers, customers and the general public are also affected by the activities of public corporations; their satisfaction should also be given significant attention. This can be achieved probably through regular opinion polls or checks carried out by governments or regulatory agencies to ascertain from other stakeholders their level of satisfaction with the service delivery of public corporations. The opinions of employees under the managers could also be sampled to rate the efficiency of managers in these public corporations.
6. Ethical issues were also found to have positive and statistically significant effects on the efficiency of managers in public corporations. These are, based on what value system guides the individual manager's responses to issues in the workplace and fall into eight classifications as revealed in extant literature reviewed. Some of these ‘issues may manifest in ethical problems or ethical dilemma or conflicts among others which may force managers to settle for ethical negotiation. This is a situation where the manager settles for a compromise not because of the "rightness" of a decision but by giving in to powerful pressure groups, overlooking the morality of an action taken in the process. Here, decisions taken by the manager are determined by voting, deal cutting and consensus- seeking rather than based on the right thing which may have adverse effects on the efficiency of the manager in public corporations. It is therefore recommended that structures be put in place to protect the managers from the influences of such powerful pressure groups and to ensure that a sound ethical climate is provided for managers to function efficiently
7. For each corporation to fulfill her obligations in satisfying the expectations of the numerous stakeholders, the efficiency of the manager is a major prerequisite. The findings of this study suggest that sound adherence to statutory code of corporate governance will enhance managerial efficiency in public corporations. This study therefore recommends that each corporation puts in place, sound and efficient internal monitoring systems to regularly evaluate the activities of the corporation to ensure strict

and diligent adherence to existing codes of corporate governance as they affect each corporation.

This study also recommends that similar studies could be carried out in other sectors different from the ones used in this study to evaluate their levels of compliance to existing codes of corporate governance and managerial efficiency, so that adequate steps can be taken to generally' improve the efficiency of public corporations in Nigeria to satisfy stakeholder expectations.

Contributions to Knowledge

1. Most studies in corporate governance consider the seven (7) elements used in measuring corporate governance but the current study improved on the corporate governance framework, by adding three (3) new independent variables namely ethical issues, political influence, monitoring and evaluation which also impact on, influence or affect managerial efficiency in public corporations.

2. Most studies use corporate efficiency as if it is synonymous with or equals managerial efficiency. However, this study examines the individual efficiency of managers introducing the use of four key managerial efficiency indicators namely –Resources acquisition and management, Accomplishment of organisational goals; Satisfaction of stakeholder expectations and Optimal management of internal resources. This thus provides criteria for evaluating the efficiency of individual managers in corporations to aid stakeholders in taking decisions concerning the corporation and tenure of each manager

3. Majority of previous studies have come to the conclusion that public corporations do not comply with corporate governance practices. This study provides empirical evidence of partial compliance (in varying degrees) though not total compliance (less than 100%) corporate governance practices in public corporations in Nigeria

4. The study provides strong evidence that corporate governance predicts managerial efficiency in public corporations. This research work established this with the results of the Duncan's post hoc tests carried out separately on the two variables having the groupings of selected public corporations falling into exactly the same pattern in corporate governance practices as they fall into groupings in managerial efficiency.

5. The study established that there is a low level of awareness of the importance of monitoring and evaluation of public corporations in Nigeria, in addition to poor systems of operations of monitoring and evaluation by regulatory agencies

6. The study offered a conceptual model that depicts the relationship between corporate governance framework and managerial efficiency in Nigerian public sector enterprises.

Suggestions for Further Studies

The findings of this study show that though a lot of studies have been carried out on corporate governance practices and corporate performance using various measures such as chief executive officer tenure, board size, board composition among others as determinants of managerial efficiency, very few studies exist which give attention to the individual abilities and competence of the manager as measures of managerial efficiency. It is therefore recommended that further research studies be carried out in the following areas.

The four measures of managerial efficiency utilised in this study which are how skilled the manager is in accomplishing set organisational goals, acquisition and management of resources, optimal management of internal processes and operations and satisfaction of stakeholder expectations should be used to carry out many more studies. The results obtained should be compared side by side with results from previous studies using other measures to know if the outcome will be similar.

This study introduced three other independent variables (ethical issues, political influence and monitoring and evaluation) which could influence the level of managerial efficiency in public corporations. As there is a dearth of studies on the relationships between these variables and managerial efficiency, it is suggested that many more studies be carried out on these variables independently or as a group in relation to determine their effects on managerial efficiency. In addition, further studies could also be carried out on these independent variables to ascertain if they have any impact on corporate governance practices in corporations

Further studies should be carried out on corporate governance practices and managerial efficiency in public corporations, using some other corporations in other sectors of the economy, different from the ones already used in this study to compare the results with the findings of this study. This will be useful in ascertaining the level of compliance to corporate governance practices in addition to the level of managerial efficiency in other corporations as well as other sectors of the economy.

In addition, it is suggested that research considerations be given to finding out how an enabling environment can be created for the manager to acquire and put to use the needed skills for practice of sound corporate governance as well as enhancing the efficiency of managers in public corporations.

REFERENCES

Abubakar, A.A (2011) Political participation and discourse in social media during the 2011 Presidential Electioneering. Paper presented at the ACCE, Covenant University, Ota. September 2011.

Adams, R. B. & Ferreira, D. (2004).Gender diversity in the boardroom. Finance Working Paper No. 58/2004. ECGI Working Paper Series in Finance, Stockholm School of Economics. Available at: www.ecgi.org/wo. [Accessed on 2U08/2017jS

Adegbite, E. and Nakajima, C. (2011).Corporate governance and responsibility in Nigeria. International Journal of Disclosure and Governance, 8, 252-271.

Adelakun, 1. (2009). Vulnerability of poor urban coastal conununities to climate change in-Lagos. Nigeria.Fifth Urban research symposium, Lagos, State Nigeria. Available at: http://www.un.org/esa/population/wup2003Report.pdf. [Accessed May 20, 2013

Adeyemi, S. B. & Kehinde, O. A., (2011).Stakeholders' perception of the independence of statutory auditors in Nigeria. Serbian Journal ofManagement,'6 (2), 247-267

Adeyemi,.S.B. & Okpala, O. (2011). The impact of audit independence on financial reporting: Evidence from Nigeria. Business and Management Review, 1(4), 9-25

Ajibolade, S.O. (2008). A survey of the perception of ethical behaviour of future Nigerian accounting g professionals. The Nigerian Accountant, 41(3), 54-59.

Akata, G. O. (2017). Corporate governance: An emerging economy perspective. University Press Plc., ibadan.

Akinhunola, R. O. Adekunle, O. A. & Adedipe, O. A. (2013). Corporate governance and banks' performance in Nigeria. European Journal of Business and Social Sciences, 2(8), 89 - 111.

Al Sawalqa; F. (2014). Corporate governance mechanisms and voluntary disclosure compliance: The case of banks in Jordan. *International Journal ofAcademic Research in Accounting, Finance and Management Sciences, 4(2),* 369-384

Ameer, R., Ramli, F. & Zakaria, H. (2010).A new perspective on board composition and firm performance in an emerging market. ***Corporate Governance,** 10(5), 647-661*

Amenta, E., & Ramsey, K. M. (2010).Institutional theory. In Leicht K. T., Jenkins J. C. (Eds.), The handbook of politics: State and civil society in global perspective (pp. *15-40).* New York: Springer.

Amran, A., Bin, A.M. & Hassan, B.C. (2009). Risk reporting: an exploratory study on risk management disclosure in Malaysian Annual *Reports.Managerial Auditing Journal,* 24 *(1),39-57.*

Anthony, B., Sridharan V.G., Farshid, N., & Braendle, *U. C. (2012).The theoretical **foundations of corporate** governance.* Available at: http://virtusinterpress.org/,iddditional files/book corp govern/ sample chapter02.1)df. Accessed on October 29, 2013

Anyirn, F.C., Ufodiama, N.M., & Olusanya, O.A. (2014). Ethics in Nigeria Public Sector: The HR practitioners' perspectives. *European Journal of Business and Social Sciences, 2(8),* 132-143

Ararat, M., Orbay, H. & Yurtoglu, B. B. (2010). The Effects of Board Independence in Controlled Firms: Evidence from Turkey. *Workingpaper.*

Atu, O.G., Atu, O. O., Atu, O.V., & Abusomwan, R.E. (2013). The role of audit committee in enhancing financial reporting in Nigeria. 10SR *Journal of Business and Management,* 13(1), 27-34

Australian Government Productivity Commission Research Note -AGPCRN, (2013).

Babalola, A. (2016). Lagos -Recognition as commercial capital city of Nigeria. founder.abuad.ng. Retrieved 20`h February, 2018 from http://www.abuad.edu.ng/lagos-*recognition-as-commercial-capital-city-of-nigeria/*

Babayanju, A.A., Animasaun, R.O. & Sanyaolu, W.A. (2017). Financial reporting and ethical compliance: The role of regulatory bodies in Nigeria. *Account and Financial Management Journal, 2(2),* 600-616

Badejo-Okusanya, O. (2011). Corporate governance in the public sector: Challenges and prospects, A paper presented at the 35th Conference of the Institute of Chartered Secretaries and Administrators (ICSAN), Ikeja Sheratotl Hotels and Towers, October 26th-27th, 2011.

Bhasin, M. (2009). Corporate governance and transparency scenario: An empirical study of Asia. International Review *of* Business Research Papers, 5(6), 269-297.

Black, B. (1990). Shareholder passivity re-examined. Michigan Law Review, 89, 522-566.

Boyle, R. & Lemaire, D. (1999). Building effective evaluation capacity. Lessons from practice. New Brunswick. USA: Transaction Publishers

Bryant, J. (2017). Corporate governance in Nigeria: A legal trajectory. http://www iohnsonbrvant.com. Retrieved on 12`h February, 2018.

Bryce. R. (2002). Pipe dreams, greed, ego and the death *of* Enron. Oxford, United Kingdom: Public Affairs Ltd.

Bryman, A., & Bell, E. (2011).Business research methods, (3rd eds.). Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Burki. A. A. & Niazi, G. S. (2004).Impact of financial reforms on efficiency of state-owndd, private and foreign banks in Pakistan. ***CMER*** Working Paper No. 06-49.

Bushman, R.M., Piotroski, J.D., & Smith, A.J. (2004). What determines corporate transparency? ***Journal ofAccounting*** Research, 42(2), 207-252.

Byrd, J., Cooperman, E. S. & Wolfe, G. A. (2010). Director tenure and the compensation o£ bank CEOs. Managerial Finance, 36(2), 86-102

Cadbury, A. (2000). Global Corporate Governance Forum, World Bank, quoted by Hopkins in "What if any is the relation between corporate governance and corporate social responsibility. (www.csmworldorylpublicest-governance).

Cadbury, S. A. (1992). Report *of* the committee on the financial aspects *of* corporate governance. London Gee & Co. Ltd..

Caddy, J. (2001). Why citizens are central to good governance. OECD Observer, 229, 59-60.

Carpenter, M. A. & Sanders,'W.G. (2002). Top management team compensation: The missing link between CEO pay and firm performance. Strategic Management Journal, 23, 367-375.

Cheng, C.M. & Jaggi, B.L. (2000). The association between independent non-executive directors, family control and financial disclosures, Journal *of* Accounting and Public Policy, 19(4/5), 285-310.

Cheng, S. (2008). Board size and the variability of corporate performance. Journal *of* Financial *Economics,* 87 (1), 157-176.

Chouinard, J. A. & Cousins, J. B. (2013). Participatory evaluation for development: Examining research-based knowledge from within the African context. *African Evaluation Journal, 1(1),* 1-9.

Clarke, T. *(2004).Theories* of *corporate governance: The philosophical foundations* of *corporate governance.* London and New York: Routledge, p. 1-30. ISBN 0-415-32308-8[Online] Available at: . https://www:corpgov.net/2010/08/entrepreneurs-and-democracy-a-political-theory-of-corporate-governance/. August 14, 2010. [Accessed 30°' November, 2017]. ,

Coakes, S. J., Steed,L., & Dzidic, P. (2006). *SPSS: Analysis without anguish version 13. 0 for Windows.* Milton, Qld: John Wiley & Sons. Australia

Collis, J. & Hussey, *R. 2003.Business research: A practical guide for undergraduate and postgraduate students.* 2nd ed. New York: Pal-rave MacMillan.

Companies and Allied Matters Act (1990). Laws of the Federal Republic of Nigeria 1990, Federal Government Printers, Lagos Nigeria.

Coot, P-, (1999). Privatization and utility regulation in developing countries: The lessons so far. ***Amials of Public and Co-operative Economics,*** 70(4), 549-587.

Cooper, D.R. & Schindler, P.S. *(2011).Business Research Methods,* (11th eds.). New York: McGraw-Hill/Irwin.

Core, J. E., Holthausen, R,W., & Larcker, D.F. (1999). Corporate governance, Chief executive officer compensation and firm performance. *Journal* of *Financial Economics,* 51, 371-406.

Craig, V. V. (2005). The changing corporate governance environment: Implications for the banking industry. *FDIC Banking Review, 16, 1-13*

Daft, R. L. (1995). *Organization Theory and Design.* New York: West Publishing.

Daily, C. M., Dalton, D. R., & Canella, A. A. (2003). Corporate governance: Decades of dialo gue and data. *Academy* of *Management Review,* 28(3), 371-382.

Daraio, C. & Simar, L. (2007). *Advanced robust and non parametric methods in efficiency analysis, methodology and applications.* Retrieved from htt-o://www.springer.com/978-0-387-351550-1.Accessed 30`x' November, 2015. ISBN: 978-0-387-35155-1.

David, O. R_. (2004). *Auditor's dictionary: Terms, concepts, processes, and regulations.* USA: John Wiley & Son Inc.

Davis, J. H., Schoorman, F. D., & Donaldson, L. (1997).T owards a stewardship theory of management. *Academy of Management Review,* 22(1), 20-47.

De Vos, A., Strydom, H., Fouche, C. &~ Delport, C. (2005). *Research at grass roots: For the social and human service professions.* 3rd ed. Pretoria: Van Schaik.

Demaki, G. O. (2011). Proliferation of codes of corporate governance in Nigeria and economic development. *Business and Management Review, 1(6),* 01- 07

Denis, D.K., & McConnell, J.J. (2003). International corporate governance. *Journal of Financial and Quantitative Analysis*, 38, 1-36.

Desai, R.J. & Olofsgard, A. (2011). The costs of political influence: firm-level evidence from developing countries. Available at: *https://www.hhs.selcontentassetslab43a67460884025 b469dc2ecbea618f/2011-the-costs-of-political-infuence.pdf.* [Accessed on 24/06/2017]

Diamantopoulos, A., & Winklhofer, H. M. (2001). Index construction with formative indicators:

An alternative to Discovering Statistics Using SPSS scale development. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 38(2), 269-277.

Dillman, D. (2000). *Mail and Internet Surveys: The tailored design method*, (2nd eds..). New York: Wiley Corporation.

Eng, L.L. & Mak, Y.T. (2003) Corporate governance and voluntary disclosure. *Journal of Accounting and Public Policy*, 22, 325-46,

Enofe, A.O., Aronmwan, E.J. & Abadua, H.S. (2013) **Audit committee report in corporate** financial statements: Users' perception in Nigeria. *European Journal of Accounting Auditing and Finance Research, 1(1)*, 16-28

Field, A. (2005). *Discovering Statistics Using SPSS.* 2"d ed. London: Sage Publication.

Financial Stability Forum (2001).The Financial Stability Forum (FSF), chaired by Andrew Crockett, General Manager, Bank for International Settlements, held its fifth meeting on 22-23 March 2001 at the World Banl< in Washington D.C.

Financial Times (I997).Defrnition of corporate governance - Financial Times Lexicon.'Retrieved from lexicon.ft.com/Term=corporate-governance

Fisher, C. & Lovell, A. *(2003).Business ethics and values.* United States: Prentice Hall.

Forsberg, R. (1989). Outside directors and management monitoring. *Akron Business and Economic Review*, 20,24-32

Freidman, A. L., & Miles, S.(2006). *Stakeholders: Theory and practice*. London: Oxford University Press.

Fuzia, S. F., Syahrina, A. A. & Julizaerma, M. K.. (2016). Board independence and firm performance. *Procedia Economics and Finance;* 37, 460-465.